



CBO Tri-Union Conference

November 4-5, 2010

CUPE Research

INTRODUCTION

Ten years ago, the three unions in the Community Based Organization (CBO) sector working with the Associations released a Job Evaluation Study. The CBO/Labour Alliance developed a participatory job evaluation process in 1998 that examined twenty CBO jobs for evaluation. The classification plan of the Saskatchewan Public Service/SGEU was used to assess the comparable pay rate for similar jobs in the CBO sector.

The final evaluation of the positions was conducted in 2000 and completed in early 2001. The job evaluation found that the jobs in the CBO sector were woefully underpaid in comparison to similar jobs in the Public Service.

The CBO/Labour Alliance made a recommendation to the provincial government for a four-year plan to improve wages and working conditions in the CBO sector that included:

- A multi-year financial commitment that would ensure that by March 31, 2005 CBO workers had equal pay with government employees doing work of equal value;
- An immediate equity down payment retroactive to April 1, 2001;
- Funding for CBO agencies to recruit, train and retain staff;
- Pensions for workers in early childhood services (Child care centres and ECIPs);
- Adequate funding for sick leave and other basic benefits.

In the time since the Job Evaluation report was done, there have been improvements in funding to the CBO sector. The full recommendations have not yet been met, however, and equal pay for work of equal value has not been reached.

The important question for the sector is: how much progress have we made? What is the gap between wages in the CBO sector and similar jobs in the public service?

In this report we have updated the calculations done in 2000 by the CBO/Labour Alliance for CBO workers represented by CUPE.

What we have found is that the gap has closed, but there is still much progress that needs to be made to reach wage equity for workers in the CBO sector.

Group Home Workers Wages

A survey of the wages in CUPE organized group homes is presented in Table 1.

Of the eleven collective agreements reviewed, six of them have wage rates that are in effect for 2010. Three of the agreements still have 2008 wage rates, which do not reflect the 7% increase provided for wages from the government in 2009.

The average start rate of jobs in this sector is \$14.06. The top wage rate average is \$15.82.

These are the averages for actual jobs, but Social Services provides funding at a specific rate. Recent Appendix As for Group Homes indicate that the funding per full-time equivalent (FTE) Program Staff is \$35,080 per year. Based on 2,080 annual hours, that is the equivalent of \$16.87 an hour, which is higher than the average negotiated wage rate in CUPE Group Home agreements.

Table 2 updates information from the CBO/Labour Alliance Job Evaluation Study with current wage rates and funding levels.

In the Job Evaluation Study, the various Group Home job classifications were rated according to the PSC/SGEU pay classification system. Table 2 shows the SGEU pay band along with the most recent maximum hourly rate in the SGEU/PSC collective agreement (October 10, 2010). This wage rate is compared to the hourly rate as funded by Social Services, and the gap in dollars per hour is shown.

In 2010, the wage gap remains high: from \$7.26 an hour to \$13.15 an hour, depending on the position.

In 2001, the wage gap ranged from \$7.87 to \$13.52 an hour, which makes it seem that there hasn't been much progress at all at closing the wage gap. In fact, there has been progress.

Measuring the gap solely in dollar amounts, however, is not the most accurate way to view the gap. The 2001 Job Evaluation Study did not calculate by what percentage CBO wages were below comparable jobs in the public service. It only calculated the dollar difference in wages. In Table 2, we have calculated the wage gap not only in dollars, but also as a percentage.

For example, an Independent Living Worker and a Senior Job Coach are both classified as being comparable to public service jobs paid at Pay Band 5, or at \$24.13 an hour in 2010. The funding rate in 2010 is \$16.87 an hour, which is \$7.26 an hour less, or 43% below the public service job rate. In 2001, the hourly gap between these jobs and the Public Service jobs was \$7.87, or 79.6% below the public service job rate. Although it may appear that the wage gap only closed by 61 cents, the gap is actually smaller when expressed as a percentage value.

TABLE 1

Comparison of Saskatchewan Group Home Workers Wages, 2010

CUPE Local	Employer	Job Title	Min Rate	Max Rate	Months to Top Step	Effective Date	CA Expiry
3207	Cheshire Homes of Regina	Care Worker SILP Rec Worker	\$13.89 \$13.89	\$17.04 \$17.04	3952 hrs 3952 hrs	Apr 1/10	Mar 31/12
3354	Battlefords Residential Services	Facilitators Careworker Caseworker SLP Casual	\$12.51 \$12.51 \$12.51 \$12.51	\$16.61 \$16.61 \$16.61 \$14.77	8320 hrs 8320 hrs 8320 hrs 4160 hrs	Apr 1/09	Mar 31/11
3364	MacKenzie Society	Res. Support Worker, Activity Worker Community Integration Worker Vocational Life Skills Instructor Home Coordinator	\$13.28 \$14.60 \$13.28 \$14.99	\$15.41 \$16.64 \$15.41 \$17.14	5200 hrs 5200 hrs 5200 hrs 5200 hrs	Apr 1/10	Mar 31/12
3370	Nipawin & District Services	SILP Worker, Shop Super, Activity Super, Development Super FT Residential Careworker	\$15.12 \$15.12	\$16.83 \$16.83	18 18	Apr 1/10	Mar 31/11
3462	Cypress Hills Ability Centre	Group Home Dev Aides, Program SW SL Workshop, Activity Area Supervisor Supported Employment Coach	\$14.36 \$15.58 \$13.46	\$15.78 \$16.56 \$14.93	2081 hrs	Apr 1/09	Mar 31/12
3481	Rail City Industries	Care Provider, Coach, Mentor Coordinator	\$13.86 \$16.00	\$15.55 \$17.00	24 24	Oct 1/10	Mar 31/11
3583	Wilkie Independent Living	Support/Comm Worker I Support/Comm Worker II Support Worker Sleep I Support Worker Sleep II Supervisor I Supervisor II	\$12.91 \$13.46 \$9.86 \$10.71 \$16.83 \$17.49	\$15.43 \$15.43 \$10.71 \$10.71 \$18.17 \$19.08	24 18 24 0 18 18	Oct 1/08	Mar 31/11
3680	Yail Harbour Inc.	Group Home Operator (24 Hr) Relief Group Home Operator (24 Hours) Program Assistant (8 & 5 hr)	\$10.06 \$9.68 \$13.50	\$10.06 \$9.68 \$16.26	0 0 36	Apr 1/10	Mar 31/11
4324	Redvers Activity Centre	Group Home Operator (daily rate) Group Home Programmers Special Needs Worker II Relief Term Position II Job Developer Activity Worker I, Devt Program, SIL Worker I, Night Care Worker I	\$246.81 \$13.05 \$13.78 \$13.05 \$16.68 \$15.95	\$256.71 \$13.92 \$14.59 \$13.92 \$17.52 \$16.81	18 18 18 18 18 18	Apr 1/10	Mar 31/12
4330	Self Help & Rec/Ed (SHARE)	Rehabilitation Worker Way to Work Coordinator	\$14.18 \$28.51	\$15.39 \$28.51	36 0	Oct 1/08	Mar 31/11
4552	Deer Park Villa	V1, 2, 3, SILP Activity Centre, Comm Access Worker Team Leader	\$12.20 \$12.70 \$14.20	\$14.70 \$15.20 \$16.70	180 180 180	Jan 1/08	Sept 30/10
		Average Wage	\$14.06	\$15.82			

CUPE Research. Available wage rates as of October 31, 2010

Nine years ago, the government funding level would have needed a 79.6% increase to reach wage parity with the public service. Today, the funding rate would have to increase by 43% to reach parity with the public service.

Although the target is still miles away, we are getting closer by meters.

Table 2

Group Home Workers' Wage Comparison to PSC/SGEU Rates, 2010							
Job Title	PSC/SGEU Pay Band	Max hrly wage PSC/SGEU*	Funding Level hourly rate ^	\$ per hr gap	% gap 2010	% gap 2001	\$/hr gap 2001
Group Home Operator (Home Operator - GH)	7	\$28.15	\$15.00	\$13.15	87.7%	187.8%	\$13.52
Shift Operator (GH Supervisor)	7	\$28.15	\$16.87	\$11.28	66.9%	109.5%	\$10.83
Program Staff - Voc (Supported Employ Spec)	7	\$28.15	\$16.87	\$11.28	66.9%	107.4%	\$10.73
Independent Living Worker (Program staff -Voc)	5	\$24.13	\$16.87	\$7.26	43.0%	79.6%	\$7.87
Senior Job Coach (Program Staff - SILP)	5	\$24.13	\$16.87	\$7.26	43.0%	79.6%	\$7.87
Vocational Training Instructor (Program - Voc)	6	\$26.06	\$16.87	\$9.19	54.5%	92.1%	\$9.20

* maximum (job rate) in PSC/SGEU agreement as of October 10, 2010 to October 9, 2011

2010-11 funding per FTE: \$35,080

^ Supported Employment Specialist and Vocational Training Instructor equivalent to Program Staff in Vocational Programs. Funding level of \$16.87 an hour derived by dividing benchmark funding by 2,080 annual hours ($\$35,080/2,080=\16.87).

Group Home operator equivalent to home operator in CLD funding benchmarks. Funding level of \$15.00 derived by dividing annual funding benchmark by 4,380 annual hours ($182.5 \times 24 \text{ hr shifts/year}$) ($\$65,690/4,380=\15.00).

Group Home Supervisor funding level derived by dividing annual funding benchmark by 2,080 hours ($\$35,080/2,080=\16.87). Senior Job Coach and Independent Living Worker equivalent to Program staff under supported Independent Living Programs benchmark.

Funding level of \$16.87 derived by dividing benchmark by 2,080 hours annually ($\$35,080/2,080=\16.87).

Early Learning/Child Care Wages

CUPE represents workers in eleven child care centres in the province. Table 3, on the next page, shows the wage rates of child care classifications in nine CUPE collective agreements. All but two of the agreements have wage rates for 2010 – two agreements have 2009 wage rates until new rates can be bargained. The wage rates from another two agreements were not included in the table because their rates were from 2008 or earlier.

The average maximum wage rate for ECE (Early Childhood Educator) II positions is \$16.89 an hour. The average top wage rate for ECE III positions is \$18.02 an hour.

In the CBO/Labour Alliance Job Evaluation Study, the child care positions used in the comparison were Childcare Worker and Day Care Provider and they were placed at PSC/SGEU Pay Band 4 and Pay Band 3. In 2001 the average wage for these positions was \$11.12 an hour and \$9.10 an hour, respectively. The hourly wage gap with the public service was \$6.32 and \$7.35.

In our updated comparison, we have used both the Early Childhood Educator II and III wage rates and kept them tied to Pay Band 4.

Table 4 shows that Pay Band 4 in the current PSC/SGEU collective agreement has a maximum wage rate of \$22.35 an hour effective October 10, 2010.

In comparison, the average maximum wage rate of a CUPE ECE II is \$16.89, or \$5.46 less than the public service rate. The average maximum wage rate of CUPE ECE III positions is \$18.02 an hour, or \$4.33 less than the public service rate.

Expressed in percentage terms, the average top wage rate of an ECE III would need a 24% increase to reach Pay Band Level 4, and the average top rate of an ECE II would need a 32.3% increase.

In 2001, a Childcare Worker would have needed a 56.8% increase to reach wage parity with similar jobs in the public service.

Table 3

CUPE Child Care Worker Wage Survey, 2010													
Local	Employer	ECE I Min rate	ECE I max	ECE II Min rate	ECE II max	ECE III Min rate	ECE III max	Casual ECE	Casual max	Cook Min rate	Cook max	Months to max	Effective date
1902	Wascana Day Care Coop	\$14.51	\$16.49	\$15.17	\$18.73	\$16.16	\$20.53	\$11.74	\$16.49			48	1-Jan-10
1902-1	Campus Day Care Coop*					\$17.40	\$17.40	\$12.22	\$15.96			0	1-Jan-09
1902-4	Awasis Child Care Coop	\$13.58	\$16.44	\$13.73	\$18.13	\$14.45	\$19.84	\$11.41	\$11.41	\$14.55	\$14.55	108	1-May-10
1902-6	Rink Ave Day Care Coop^	\$16.72	\$16.97	\$17.10	\$17.36	\$17.62	\$17.89	\$10.93	\$11.36			12	1-Jan-10
1902-9	USSU Childcare Centre					\$16.53	\$19.89	\$10.05	\$10.29	\$15.37	\$18.24	24	1-May-10
3683	Accent on Kids CCC	\$13.62	\$15.35	\$14.42	\$15.96	\$14.65	\$16.21			\$11.26	\$15.35	4161 hrs	1-Jan-10
3693	Families First CCC	\$12.93	\$15.57	\$13.52	\$17.19	\$13.90	\$17.82	\$11.09	\$11.19	\$12.27	\$14.98	72	1-Jan-10
4131	Humpty Dumpty CCC	\$12.85	\$14.65	\$14.00	\$15.80	\$15.20	\$17.00	\$10.90	\$12.80	\$10.80	\$12.70	60	1-May-09
4449	Glencairn Childcare	\$11.09	\$12.91	\$11.70	\$15.03	\$12.30	\$15.63	\$8.82		10.48	12.3	60	1-Jan-10
	Average wage	\$13.61	\$15.48	\$14.23	\$16.89	\$15.36	\$18.02	\$10.90	\$12.79	\$12.46	\$14.69		

CUPE Research. October 30, 2010.

* Local 1902-01. Wages are expressed in a monthly wage of \$2,262.16 for Day Care Worker. Hours of work are 6 hours/day or 30 hours/week. The hourly rate of \$17.40 was determined by calculating an annual wage of \$27,145.92 and dividing by 1560 annual hours.

^ Local 1902-06. Wages are expressed in a monthly start wage of \$2,716.54 for ECE I, \$2,778.10 for ECE II, and \$2,862.62 for ECE III.

The hourly rate was determined by calculating an annual wage and dividing by 1950 annual hours.

Table 4
Comparison of Average Child Care Worker Wages to PSC/SGEU, 2010

PSC/SGEU Level 4 top wage rate*	ECE II max rate	\$/hour gap	% diff	ECE III max rate	\$/hour gap	% diff
\$22.35	\$16.89	\$5.46	32.3%	\$18.02	\$4.33	24.0%
\$/hour gap in 2001		\$6.32			\$6.32	
% difference 2001			56.8%			56.8%
<i>*PSC/SGEU top wage rate effective October 10, 2010 to October 9, 2011</i>						

Compared to the wage gap for Group Home workers, Early Childhood Educators have a small wage gap to bridge. It is worth noting, however, that childcare workers' jobs were evaluated at a lower pay band level (4) than group home workers (5-7). With increased educational requirements, it is possible that childcare workers might score higher in a job evaluation plan done today.

Provincial Government Child Care Wage Survey

The Early Learning and Child Care Branch within the Ministry of Education also conducts a provincial wage study of child care workers. Their most recent survey reviewed wage rates as of December 2008, and they include comparative data from 2006 and 2007. Their survey shows that average hourly wage rates have been increasing, most significantly between 2007 and 2008.

The average hourly wage rates by certification level (including directors of child care centres) were:

Table 5
Provincial Average Wage Rates of Child Care Workers, 2006-2008

Certification Level	November 2006	November 2007	December 2008
ECE I	\$11.66	\$12.27	\$13.36
ECE II	\$14.05	\$14.71	\$15.67
ECE III	\$15.22	\$16.19	\$17.66

Source: Early Learning Child Care Branch, Wages and Fees Annual Report, 2008

It is important to note that the provincial government's wage survey of child care workers includes directors, who would have higher wages than frontline ECE workers.

Considering that CUPE's average wage rates for ECE II and ECE III positions is higher than the provincial average, this may indicate a "union wage advantage" for child care workers in unionized workplaces.

Summary

This review of CUPE Group Home and Childcare worker wages in comparison to the Job Evaluation study done ten years ago shows that there has been progress in closing the wage gap between the CBO sector and similar jobs in the public service.

The gap has not closed as much as the CBO/Labour Alliance envisioned, but it is important to take note of what progress has taken place so we can lobby for additional funding and support.

This report only examined wages and it would be equally important to assess what progress workers in the CBO sector have made in obtaining health benefits and decent pensions.

CS/tlg.cope491